MIT March 14, 1988

Two Conjectures About Scope and LF

Howard Lasnik
University of Connecticut

I. Superiority

1. Who read what

2. [what$_j$ [who$_i$]]$_i$ [t$_i$ read t$_j$]

3. *What did who read

4. [who$_i$ [what$_j$]]$_j$ [t$_i$ read t$_j$]

5. Who$_i$ did you tell t$_i$ to read what$_i$

6. ?*What$_j$ did you tell who$_i$ to read

7. Path of t$_i$ in 2.:{S,S´}
   Path of t$_j$ in 2.:{VP,S,S´,NP$_i$}

8. Path of t$_i$ in 4.:{S,S´,NP$_j$}
   Path of t$_j$ in 4.:{VP,S,S´}

9. Path of t$_i$ in LF of 5.:{VP,S,S´}
   Path of t$_j$ in LF of 5.:{VP,S,S´,VP,S,S´,NP$_i$}

10. Path of t$_i$ in LF of 6.:{VP,S,S´,NP$_j$}
    Path of t$_j$ in LF of 6.:{VP,S,S´,VP,S,S´}

11. *John wonders what who read

12. (*)Who wonders what who read
    a. *[who$_i$] [t$_i$ wonders [[who$_k$ [what$_j$]]$_j$ [t$_k$ read t$_j$]]]
    b. ?[who$_k$ [who$_i$]]$_i$ [t$_i$ wonders [[what$_j$] [t$_k$ read t$_j$]]]
    c. ?Who thinks (that) who read the book

13. Path of t$_k$ in 12b.:{S,S´,VP,S,S´,NP$_i$}
    Path of t$_j$ in 12b.:{VP,S,S´}

14. "No rule can involve X, Y in the structure
    ...X...[...Z...WYV...]...
    where the rule applies ambiguously to Z and Y and Z is superior to Y.

15. Superiority is relevant only when two WHs are ´competing´ for the same LF position.

16a. A WH-phrase X in COMP is O(perator)-disjoint from another WH-phrase Y if assignment of the index of X to Y would result in the local A´-binding of Y by X. (S-structure)
  b. If two WH-phrases are O-disjoint, they cannot undergo absorption.

17. Who$_i$ [t$_i$ wonders [what$_j$ [who$_k$ read t$_j$]]]

18. Who$_i$ [t$_i$ wonders [what$_j$ [you told who$_k$ [[PRO to read t$_k$]]]]]

II. WH - Quantifier Interactions

19. %What did everyone buy for Mary
19a. (Together) they bought her a car
  b. John bought her a book, Bill bought her a magazine, etc.

20. Who bought everything for Mary
20a. John did
  b.*John bought her a book, Bill bought her a magazine, etc.
21. Who did everything fall on

22. Who saw everyone

23. [who$_i$] [t$_i$ saw everyone]
+Y

24. [who$_i$] [everyone$_j$ [t$_i$ saw t$_j$]]
+Y

25. Path of t$_i$ in 24.: {S, S, S´}
    Path of t$_j$ in 24.: {VP, S, S}

26. [who$_i$] [t$_i$ [everyone$_j$ [saw t$_j$]]

27. Path of t$_i$ in 26.: {S, S´}
    Path of t$_j$ in 26.: {VP, VP}

28. [what$_i$] [[everyone$_j$] [t$_j$ bought t$_i$]]

29. Path of t$_i$ in 28.: {VP, S, S, S´}
    Path of t$_j$ in 28.: {S, S}

30. What did everyone$_i$ buy for Mary with his$_i$ bonus money

31. What did everyone buy for Mary with their bonus money

32. Who gave everyone$_i$ his$_i$ paycheck

33a. What did everyone give to his teacher
  b. What did everyone give to their teacher

34. If Op$_1$ takes scope over Op$_2$ then t$_2$ does not c-command t$_2$.

35. QR adjoins a quantifier to a minimal node so as to satisfy 34.

36. %What do you think everyone bought for Mary

37. Someone thinks everyone left

38.?%Someone loves everyone

39. Some woman loves everyone